

**TNI PT Program Executive Committee
Meeting Summary**

**September 13, 2013
Special Meeting**

1) Roll call:

Vice-Chair, Eric Smith, called the TNI PT Program Executive Committee (PTP EC) meeting to order on September 13, 2013, at 12:30PM EST. Attendance is recorded in Attachment A – there were 8 Executive Committee members present.

2) Discussion – Solids Limit Recommendation

There were 8 out of 12 members on the call (2/3 of committee).

Eric summarized the issue. The Chemistry FoPT subcommittee received a complaint from New York's PT Program and TNI received 3 formal complaints regarding the new NPW TSS limits that were effective on July 1, 2013. Some PT Providers and data users have seen a significant increase in the failure rate and asked that the limit be reviewed.

The Chemistry FoPT Subcommittee met to discuss the issue and decided to make a recommendation to the PTP EC that the limits for TSS, TDS and TS revert back to the 2011 FoPT table limits, but keep the concentration range of the 2013 FoPT table. There were some additional comments received by subcommittee members who were not on the call when this issue was discussed. The subcommittee passed on the recommendation and the additional comments to the PTP EC:

Chemistry FoPT Subcommittee Recommendation:

Joe motioned that for Total Dissolved Solids, Total Solids, and Total Suspended Solids the original regression equations from the 2011 NPW table be made effective again. The concentrations should remain as currently listed on the 2013 table that was approved by the PTP EC. This is summarized below:

Total Dissolved Solids - PDF file – 11-19-2010. Old linear regression equation coefficients: a & b = study mean $c = 0.0686$ $d = 4.3676$ Concentration Range: 140-800 mg/L.

Total Solids - PDF file 11-19-2010. Old linear regression equation coefficients: $a = 0.9875$ $b = 1.789$ $c = 0.0107$ $d = 9.594$. Concentration Range: 140-800 mg/L.

Total Suspended Solids – PDF file – 11-19-2010. Old linear regression equation coefficients: $a = 0.9728$ $b = -0.6338$, $c = 0.0300$ and $d = 1.5793$. Concentration Range: 20 – 120 mg/L.

Vote: For – 4 (Carl, Joe, Stacey and Melanie) Against – 3 (Dan, Jeff and Stephen) Abstain – 0

Additional Comments Received with Against Votes:

Jeff Lowry: Please see the attached plots from 2010. By no means should we approve TDS as a study mean to determine the acceptance limits. The emails only questioned the TSS not the TDS and TS. Therefore, my vote is no.

I would accept only the change in the analyte of concern and that is the old equation for TSS.

Please note if you decide to change the TDS concentrations, please consider the Specific Conductance analyte would need to change also.

This should go back to the subcommittee for a technical review with PT Provider data review before TDS and TS are changed. Very simple: Use the 2013 equation and evaluate PT Provider data for the last 12 month period. We did it for the new equations when we approved them. But, we did not do this for TSS.

Stephen Arpie: Good points, and I agree to only change the TSS back to the previous table. That will allow labs a 20% range (approximately) instead of 10% (absolutely).

Overall, this was only a minor problem for our participants and I suspect they would improve their technique if left alone.

Dan Dickinson: Sorry I missed the call yesterday. I think the TDS and Total Solids are fine as is. They don't need to be part of the motion. If we could do a friendly amendment to limit the motion to just TSS, then I would support it. As is, I cannot, so my vote is "No". Likewise, I would not be in favor of a fixed limit of 20%.

Associate member, Shawn Kassner, confirmed that they only saw a possible issue with TSS.

Stephen wanted a review of how a limit can be changed after it has been voted in. SOP procedures were reviewed.

After discussion, the committee members on the call preferred to see the old criteria put back in place for only TSS until the limits could be further evaluated. They want to see the Chemistry FoPT Subcommittee review additional data and update the limits as

appropriate in the future. They did not feel there was any need to invalidate the study and agreed with the NELAP AC request to have any reports issued with a failure for TSS since July 1, 2013 be re-evaluated with the change in criteria. The change would be retroactive and the limits would be considered effective on July 1, 2013. The table should be updated with the older limits for TSS (concentration range remains the same) and a "Rev 1" added to the header.

PTP EC Motion: The following motion was made:

A motion was made by Nicole that the original regression equation for Total Suspended Solids on the NPW FoPT table be made effective again (old regression equation coefficients: $a = 0.9728$, $b = -0.6338$, $c = 0.0300$ and $d = 1.5793$). The concentration will remain as currently listed on the NPW FoPT table effective 7-1-13 (Concentration Range: 20-100 mg/L). An effective date will be determined after approval by the NELAP AC and contacting the PT Providers. The motion was seconded by Andy. There was no further discussion.

Updated 9/16/13: Vote: For – 10 Against – 0 Abstain – 1 (Carl) (No vote from Steve Gibson – Retired.)

Ilona will schedule a call after the NELAP AC meeting on Monday with the PT Providers and PTPAs to evaluate any implementation issues and to give them the opportunity to ask questions.

Updated 9/19/13: The NELAP AC met again on 9/19/13 with 11 out of 15 members on the call. They started their voting process with 11 votes "For" the update. The remaining 4 votes are being collected by e-mail.

Updated 9/20/13: Stacie and Ilona met with the PT Providers on 9/20/13. There was general agreement with the change and a decision was made to reissue any reports that originally had a TSS failure after 7/1/13.

A letter that included the updated table was sent to each PT Provider and PTPA. The table will be posted as a NELAP approved table on or before 10/3/13 when the NELAP AC official vote closes. The table has been approved for use by the PTP EC.

3. New Business

None.

4. Next Meeting

The next regularly scheduled call will be on September 26, 2013 at 1pm EST.

The special meeting was adjourned at 1:15pm EST.

Attachment A

Participants TNI

Proficiency Testing Program Executive Committee

Members	Affiliation	Contact Information
Stacie Metzler (2009) CHAIR Absent	HRSD	757-460-4217 smetzler@hrsd.com
Ilona Taunton, Program Administrator Present	TNI	828-712-9242 tauntoni@msn.com
Eric Smith (2010) Present	ALS Environmental	904-394-4415 eric.smith@alsglobal.com
Justin Brown (2011) Absent	Environmental Monitoring and Technologies, Inc.	847-875-2271 jbrown@emt.com
Steve Gibson (2011) Absent	Texas Comm. on Env. Quality	512-239-1518 jgibson@tceq.state.tx.us
Susan Butts (2012) Present	South Carolina DHEC	(803)896-0978 buttse@dhec.sc.gov
Carl Kircher (2010) Present	Florida DOH	904-791-1574 carl_kircher@doh.state.fl.us
Patrick Brumfield (2012) Present	Sigma-Aldrich RTC	(307) 721-5488 Pat.Brumfield@sial.com
Michella Karapondo (2011) Absent	USEPA	513-569-7141 karapondo.michella@epa.gov
Jennifer Loudon (2013) Present	Raritan Township Municipal Utilities Authority	(908) 782-7453 x19 JLoudon@rtmua.com
Nicole Cairns (2012) Present	NY State DOH	(518) 473-0323 nlc02@health.state.ny.us
Joe Pardue (2011) Present	Pro2Serve, Inc.	423-337-3121 joe_pardue@charter.net
Dr. Andy Valkenburg (2011) Present	Energy Laboratories, Inc.	avalkenburg@energylab.com 406-869-6254
OPEN	Looking for an AB.	