TNI Chemistry FoPT Subcommittee
Meeting Summary
September 10, 2013

1. Roll call and Meeting Minutes:

   Chair Carl Kircher called the meeting of the Chemistry FoPT Subcommittee to order on September 10, 2013 at noon EST. Attendance is recorded in Attachment A. There were 3 members on the call.

   The minutes for the June 25th, July 23rd and May 14th meetings need to be approved on the next call.

2. TSS (Total Suspended Solids) Issue

   E-mail from Dan Dickinson:

   Carl,

   There is a problem with the new FoPT coefficients for TSS that needs correcting very soon. The 'a' coefficient should not = 1.0000. There is a range wide bias of about -5% between the AV and robust participant mean that was adequately accounted for with the old coefficient set. Also, further review of the 'd' coefficient of 2.50 suggests that it is appropriate only at TSS AV's under 70 mg/L. Again the old 'c' & 'd' coefficients handle the SD better for the full range.

   I would support reverting to the previous coefficients or the ones on the attached pdf.

   I couldn't use these coefficients in the NYSDOH study that just closed because the AV =98 mg/L and the participant mean=92.7 mg/L . Likewise, the participant SD was 4.30 mg/L which was a typical response for this TSS level. I couldn't arbitrarily fail a bunch of labs using the new coefficients. So I scored with the old ones because they doe a better job of modeling the data set. A2LA will be notified of this departure.

   Importantly, this appears not to be isolated in New York studies. I took a call from a Florida lab today inquiring about our perspective on the new TSS coefficients. It seems they failed a commercial PT provider's recent study that had employed the new values. Under the old values the lab would have passed. They reported that they spoke with Steve Arms earlier and he gave the lab the same advice I did. Contact the PTEC.

   (See attached file: WP Non Filterable Residue (TSS) 1960.pdf)

   Also, noteworthy, the new TDS and Total Solids coefficients are working well and fit the respective data sets.

Jeff Lowry responded with copies of the minutes from October 18, 2011 and July 31, 2012.

Ilona also shared a complaint that came in through the TNI Complaint process on 9/6/13. This is being forwarded to the PTP EC, but Ilona shared the information with the committee today given the topic:

I believe the new calculation for TSS acceptance limit is flawed. I have major concerns that the new calculation for the acceptance limits does not account for the 5% bias the old calculation had built in.

Joe noted this has been a problem for all the PT Providers. The fixed limits are not working.

The minutes Jeff forwarded were reviewed and the concerns were discussed.

Carl recommended that consistent with the meeting minutes reviewed, he would recommend using the old regression equation and the new concentration range of 20-100 mg/L.

Joe thinks this needs to be looked at closer and Total Solids, Total Dissolved Solids and Total Suspended Solids should all be converted back to the original concentration and regression equations. He is seeing some issues with all these and thinks the committee needs time to re-evaluate this from scratch. Stacey agreed with this approach.

Joe commented that the PDF the committee is looking at is from 2010 and is based on data that is 5 years old. He would like to look at more data and then evaluate what the limits should be.

After additional consideration, Carl noted that there is a Volatile Solids PT too. The subcommittee agreed there was no need to make any changes to Volatile Solids.

Carl summarized the information from the old criteria:

Total Dissolved Solids - PDF file – 11-19-2010. Old linear regression equation coefficients: 2011 FoPT Table for NPW – a & b - study mean c- 0.0686 d – 4.3676 140-800 mg/L.

Total Solids - PDF file 11-19-2010. Old linear regression equation. a – 0.9875 b – 1.789 c – 0.0107 d – 9.594. 140-800 mg/L.

Total Suspended Solids – PDF file – 11-19-2010. Old linear regression equation, a – 0.9728 b - -0.6338, c – 0.0300 and d – 1.5793. 20 – 120 mg/L.

Motion:
Joe motioned that we accept what was described by Carl using the original linear regression equations with the expanded concentration range. Second by Stacey. Use regression equations from the original 2011 table and the expanded concentrations from the 2013 table.

No further discussion.

Vote: For – 3 Against – 0 Abstain – 0

This will be distributed by e-mail to the committee for a final vote by September 13, 2013. Carl will prepare an update to the FoPT table dependent on voting results to present to the PTP EC. *(Note: Subcommittee members were asked to vote earlier so that it could be finalized and distributed to the PTP EC by Friday for a special PTP EC meeting.)*

Additional Votes:

Melanie: Voted For.

Jeff Lowry: The emails only questioned the TSS not the TDS and TS. Therefore, my vote is no.

I would accept only the change in the analyte of concern and that is the old equation for TSS.

Stephen Arpie: Good points, and I agree to only change the TSS back to the previous table. That will allow labs a 20% range (approximately) instead of 10% (absolutely).

Dan Dickinson: I think the the TDS and Total Solids are fine as is. They don't need to be part of the motion. If we could do a friendly amendment to limit the motion to just TSS, then I would support it. As is, I cannot, so my vote is "No". Likewise, I would not be in favor of a fixed limit of 20%.

The motion was passed and was forwarded to the PTP EC.)

4. Action Items

See action item table in attachments.

5. New Business

- None.

6. Next Meeting

The next meeting of the Chemistry FoPT Subcommittee will be September 24, 2013, at 12:00 PM EST.

Action Items are included in Attachment B and Attachment C includes a listing of reminders.

The meeting was adjourned at 1:06 pm. (Motion: Stacey Second: Joe Approved)

Attachment A

Participants
TNI
Chemistry FoPT Subcommittee

Members	Affiliation	Contact Information
Carl Kircher, Chair **Present**	Florida DOH	carl_kircher@doh.state.fl.us
Joe Morotti **Present**	Sigma-Aldrich RTC	Joe.morotti@sial.com
Melanie Ollila **Absent**	Pace Analytical Services, Inc.	MOllila@pacelabs.com
Jeff Lowry **Absent**	Phenova	JeffL@phenova.com
Stephen Arpie **Absent**	Absolute Standards, Inc.	stephenarpie@mac.com
Dan Dickinson **Absent**	New York, DOH	dmd15@health.state.ny.us
Stacey Fry **Present**	E.S. BABCOCK & Sons, Inc.	sfry@babcocklabs.com
Ilona Taunton, Program Administrator **Present**	TNI	828-712-9242 tauntoni@msn.com

Attachment B

Action Items – Chemistry FoPT Subcommittee

	Action Item	Who	Expected Completion	Actual Completion
102				

Attachment C

Backburner / Reminders – Chemistry FoPT Subcommittee

	Item	Meeting Reference	Comments
4	Consider nomenclature differences between the analyte codes and the FoPT tables.	2-23-10	
10			